



Board for Certification of Genealogists®

This case study is an example from an applicant's successful portfolio. It is shared with their permission for general guidance and inspiration—not as a flawless model. It met the application requirements in place at the time of submission, but those requirements may have changed. This sample may not reflect current expectations under today's *BCG Application Guide* or *Genealogy Standards*.

For accurate, up-to-date guidance, consult the current editions of the *BCG Application Guide*, the rubrics, and *Genealogy Standards*. Additional samples and resources are available in the Learning Center at <https://bcgcertification.org/learning/>

A Father for Andrew Sinclair

A Case Study using Indirect Evidence

No document provides direct evidence of Andrew Sinclair's birth family. Indeed, no document provides direct evidence of any kin relationships except for those related to his marriage and the births of some of his children. Reasonably thorough research on his life – including occupation, residence, religion, marriage, and public life – provides sufficient indirect evidence to place him in his father's family, as well as that of his likely paternal grandparents. Indirect evidence led to a hypothesis for the identity of Andrew's brothers and his father, and details of the proposed brothers and father's lives and family were found to be consistent with that hypothesis. Confidence in the hypothesis was strengthened by its power in explaining a more distant relationship and in providing a logical set of paternal grandparents for Andrew.

Andrew Sinclair (c. 1795-1874), a native of New York City, left many records that document nearly every year of his long life in lower Manhattan. None state explicitly who his parents were, but several offer concrete clues – indirect evidence – of relationships with others surnamed *Sinclair*. Taken together, they suggest that Andrew was one of three brothers—Lawrence, Andrew and George Sinclair—who were sons of James Sinclair, a house carpenter who died in 1813, and that this James was a son of James Sinclair and Gertrude (Meyer), who married in New York City in 1763.

Andrew Sinclair's life in New York City spanned one of the periods of the City's greatest growth. In the 1795 City Directory for New York City, there were eight men with the surname Sinclair,¹ while in 1872 there were 39 Sinclair men recorded.² The period also generated many documents identifying its inhabitants, including local, state and federal census records, property records, probate and estate records, tax records, church records, the first vital records kept regularly by the City (death registers), military records, and city directories. Newspapers and municipal records documented the political events of the day, and private cemetery records noted the names of those that shared privately-owned cemetery plots. Reasonably thorough research on Andrew Sinclair required that all be examined.

Andrew Sinclair (c1795-1874)

Andrew Sinclair was born about 1795 in New York City.³ He died at Morristown, New Jersey, in 1874,⁴ and was buried at Green-Wood Cemetery in Brooklyn, New York.⁵ In 1813, he married

¹ William Duncan, *The New-York Directory, and Register, for the Year 1795* (New York: Printed for the editor, 1795), 195; digital images, microfiche, *Early American Imprints, 1639-1800, First series*, no. 28598 (New York: Readex Microprint Corp., 1981-1982).

² H. Wilson, comp., *Trow's New York City Directory...for the Year Ending May 1, 1872* (New York: John F. Trow, 1872), 1064-1065; digital images, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com>) : accessed 27 November 2016).

³ Evidence from several documents suggests his birth between 1794 and 1796, in New York City. The 1819 jury census has him aged 24 years, a pump maker, one white male and two white females. 1819 Jury Census, New York City, Ward 9, Perry Street, Andrew Sinclair; New York City Municipal Archives (NYCMA), microfilm MN #10773, roll #2, suggesting a birth year of 1794 or 1795. Later censuses confirm this: in 1840 he was aged 40-49. 1840 U. S. census, New York, New York, population schedule, Ward 15, page 39 (stamped on right page), line 2, Andrew Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>) : accessed 23 October 2016), citing National Archives and Records

Clara/Clarissa Ann (Pulis) Hamilton, widow or former wife of James Hamilton.⁶ She was a daughter of Jacob Pulis and granddaughter of Christian and Clara/Clarissa/Claertye Pulis.⁷

Administration (NARA), microfilm M704, roll 308. In 1850 he was aged 53 and born in New York. 1850 U. S. census, New York, New York, population schedule, Ward 16, District 1, page 84, dwelling 258, family 722, And^w Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 15 November 2016), citing NARA microfilm M432, Roll 553. In the 1855 state census he was aged 60, born in New York County [Manhattan]. 1855 New York State census, New York, 16th ward, 1st election district, unpaginated, dwelling 192, family 755, Andrew Sinclair; Film ZAN-G124, reel 50, New York Public Library (NYPL). For New York County as Manhattan, see Laura Murphy DeGrazia, *New York City, Long Island, and Westchester County* NGS Special Publication Number 108 (Arlington, Virginia: National Genealogical Society, 2013), 4. His age of 75 in the 1860 is doubtless overstated. 1860 U. S. census, New York, New York, population schedule, 20th ward, 1st District, page 318, dwelling 746, family 2431, John W. Sinclair household; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 23 October 2016), citing NARA microfilm M653, Roll 817. His two applications for bounty land, based on his War of 1812 service, suggest a birth year of 1796. Declaration of Andrew Sinclair, 29 November 1850, and Soldier's Declaration, No., 2, of Andrew Sinclair, 21 March 1855; Andrew Sinclair (Capt. Fleming's Company, New York Militia, War of 1812), bounty land warrant file 11539, (Act of 1855, 120 acres); Case Files of Pension and Bounty Land Applications Based on Service between 1812 and 1855; Pension and Bounty Land Warrant Application Files, 1800-1960; Department of Veterans Affairs, Record Group 15; National Archives, Washington, D.C.

⁴ Andrew Sinclair, died 19 January 1874, at Morristown, [in Morris County] New Jersey, according to the registration by the City of Hoboken, Hudson County, New Jersey. Return of Deaths, Hoboken, Hudson County, Volume AW, p. 414, line 10, Andrew Sinclair; New Jersey State Archives, Trenton, NJ. Green-Wood Cemetery records state his death date as 18 January 1874 in Jersey City, New Jersey. See note 5, below. The Hoboken registration and Jersey City reference may have resulted from shipping the body to Green-wood in Brooklyn. It was not shipped through Manhattan. Entries for January–April 1874, surname letter “S,” Bodies in Transit, volume 9, 1874-1880, p. 316, roll 2; Department of Health, NYCMA. No obituary has been found in the Jersey City *Jersey Journal*, the Jersey City *American Standard*, or New York newspapers.

⁵Letter with enclosures from Veronica Benjou, Green-Wood Cemetery, 12 November 2013, in author's files, citing Lot Book, Catalogue of Heirship, Affidavits, Burial Slips, All-Index Cards, Chronological Books, and Burial Orders. Clarissa Sinclair was buried in the same lot in 1862. The lot was owned by Lawrence C. Kearney, Andrew Sinclair's son-in-law. The relationship is made based on indirect evidence: Lawrence Kearney (“Corney”) married Mary C. Sinclair in 1835. William Scott Fisher, comp., *New York City Methodist Marriages, 1785-1893* (Camden, Maine: Picton Press, 1994), 1:591. Andrew and Clara Sinclair lived in the same building as Lawrence and Mary Kearney, though enumerated in different families, in New York City in 1850 and 1855. Lawrence and Mary named a daughter Clara, after her grandmother Sinclair. 1850 U. S. census, New York, New York, pop. sch., Ward 16, Dist. 1, page 84, dwelling 258, family 721, Lawrence Kerney, and family 722, Andw Sinclair. Also, 1855 New York State Census, 16th ward, 1st election district, unpaginated, dwelling 192, family 753, Lawrence Karney, and family 755, Andrew Sinclair. Mary was the second female enumerated in Andrew's family in 1819. See note 3.

⁶ Rev. John Williams, Marriage Records, 1792–1844, p. 16, no. 51, Sinclair-Pulias marriage, 15 May 1813; NYPL microfilm *R-USLHG*ZI-1281 [formerly NYGBS film 32.13], which calls her “Mrs. Clarra A. Pulias.” She married, first, 19 December 1810, James Hamilton, son of Alexander Hamilton. New York Genealogical and Biographical Society, trans., Royden W. Vosburgh, ed., Records of the Madison Avenue Reformed Church in the City of New York (1921), 2:7, James Hamilton-Clarissy Pullis marriage; NYPL Milstein Div., NYGB AZ+Loc 09-711 [formerly NYGBS NY-29]. The church, then known as North West, was located on Franklin Street. Harry Macy Jr., “Dutch Reformed Records of New York City (Manhattan),” revised 2011, *New York Genealogical and Biographical Society* (<http://newyorkfamilyhistory.org/research-discover/research-tools/dutch-reformed-records-new-york-city-manhattan> : accessed 26 October 2016).

No record has been located of his death, but James Hamilton must have died or disappeared before her marriage to Andrew. There is a lacuna in New York City death registers from 1808 to 1812. Aaron Goodwin, *New York City Municipal Archives: An Authorized Guide for Family Historians* (New York: New York Genealogical and Biographical Society, 2016), 8. He may be the James Hamilton, house carpenter, living at 2 Harman Street in 1812. *Elliot's Improved New-York Double Directory* (New York: William Elliot, 1812), 96; digital image, *Fold3.com* (www.fold3.com: accessed 2 November 2016). *Fold3* interleaves Longworth's and Elliot's 1812 directories; the column layout and page headings allow for the two to be distinguished.

Andrew Sinclair's occupation was, at various times, pump maker, engineer, and, most often, carpenter. He appeared in New York City directories nearly every year from 1814 to 1862.⁸ In 1827 he was constable,⁹ and in 1836 and 1837 he was a clerk.¹⁰ As a young man, he served briefly in the New York militia in 1814, defending New York City during the War of 1812.¹¹ As early as 1825, he was politically active in the Ninth Ward (Greenwich Village), aligning himself with the Democratic-Republican (or Republican) ticket that supported John Quincy Adams for President in 1828, and later becoming an "Independent Democrat" and then a Whig.¹² His earliest religious affiliation, if any, is not documented, but Andrew and Clarissa had children baptized in the Methodist church in 1826 and 1829,¹³ and buried another in Methodist church ground in 1843.¹⁴

⁷ The will of her grandfather, Christian Pulis, made 2 May 1808 and proved 18 May 1818, left a legacy to Sarah, Clarissa and Nicholas Pulis, children of his deceased son Jacob Pulis, to be received after the death of his wife Claertye. Will of Christian Pulis, Surrogate's Court, New York County, Liber 54 (1816-1818), 408-411. Upon Clarissa Pulis's death, her grandchildren, including Clarissy Sinclair and Sarah Sinclair, asked the Surrogate's Court to have another grandchild, Peter Pulis, named administrator of her estate. Renunciation, estate of Clarissa Pulis, filed 24 February 1825; digital images, "New York, Wills and Probate Records, 1659-1999," *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>; accessed 2 November 2016), citing Executors Renunciations, 1823-1828.

⁸ New York City directories are widely available as digital images, notably on *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com/browse/238/h9czLWNm5> : accessed 27 November 2016). The *Fold3* collection must be used with care, since competing directories for the same year are merged, with alternating pages. Title pages are often relegated to the end of the yearly set of scans. Format and page headings allow for a specific page to be attributed to a specific publisher. References to specific directories in the present work are individually cited, either from *Fold3* or another source.

⁹ *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1827), 442; digital images, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016).

¹⁰ *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1836), 605; digital images, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016). *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1837), 561; digital images, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016).

¹¹ Payroll and receipts, Capt. Augustus Fleming's Company, 2 October–3 December 1814 (folder 1), Payroll and receipts, Sgt. Stephen Crowell's Company, 2 September–2 October 1814 (folder 2), Muster roll, 25 October 1814 (folder 2); New York State Consolidated Militia, 10th Brigade, 1st Regiment, Manuscripts and Archives Division, NYPL.

¹² See, for example, "Electors—By Districts," New York *National Advocate*, 7 November 1825, p. 2, col. 1. "Ninth Ward Nominations," New-York *Daily Advertiser*, 4 November 1825, p. 10, col. 4. "Republican Ticket" and "Ninth Ward Voice of the People," New York *Commercial Advertiser*, 3 November 1828, p. 2, col. 6. "Independent Democrats," New York *Evening Post*, 1 March 1834, p. 2, col. 6. "Whig Nomination," New York *Commercial Advertiser*, 12 April 1826, p. 2, col. 4. He was successfully named as Assistant Captain in the 4th District Watch following the 1837 election. "Board of Alderman," New York *Evening Post*, 16 May 1837, p. 2, col. 5. He lost the position in 1839 and regained it in 1844: "Board of Aldermen—May 23," New York *Commercial Advertiser*, 24 May 1839, p. 2, col. 5. "Official," New York *Spectator*, 22 May 1844, p. 3, col. 2. Digital images of all newspapers accessed through *GenealogyBank* (www.genealogybank.com).

¹³ Samuel Seaman, trans., Records of the Methodist Episcopal Church, New York, N.Y., 1785-1893, NYPL Milstein Div., NYGB AZ+Loc 09-526, vol. 13 (formerly NYGBS NY-21), p. 279 (Andrew, 1826), p. 283 (Stephen C. R., 1829).

¹⁴ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 13, George Sinclair, age 20, 24 Twelfth St., 4 April 1843; FHL 447,550. Andrew Sinclair lived at Twelfth, corner 7th Ave., in 1842, as did his son John. *The New York City Directory for 1842 and 1843* (New York: John Doggett Jr., 1842), page 292–293; digital images, *Hathitrust.org* (<http://hdl.handle.net/2027/njp.32101026899797?urlappend=%3Bseq=296> : accessed 27 November 2016). While Andrew moved the next year, John remained, and the address was described as 24 Twelfth. *Doggett's New-York City Directory for*

For native New Yorkers born in the 1790s, church records, probate records, and, for children who died young, New York City death registers (which list residence), are the main records that consistently tie parents to their children. A systematic survey of extant church records for New York City in the 1790s did not locate a birth or baptismal record for Andrew Sinclair.¹⁵ No Sinclair probate record from New York County from 1790 to 1850 named him in any context.¹⁶ He did not buy or sell real estate in New York City, and deeds to or from people named Sinclair up to 1850 do not name him in any capacity.¹⁷ The record of his own marriage in 1813 does not name his parents.¹⁸ The register of his death in New Jersey in 1874 has a blank place for his parents' names.¹⁹ While city death registers sometimes name a child's parents or the address of the deceased can be correlated with an address from a city directory, these documents are not helpful in finding the parents of a child like Andrew who survived.

While there is no direct evidence of the father or family of Sinclairs to which Andrew belonged, in conducting reasonably thorough research on his life, the lives of several other Sinclair men intersected his. An analysis of those intersections, and the lives of those men, provides indirect evidence that gives Andrew brothers, a father, paternal uncles, and grandparents.

1843 and 1844 (New York: John Doggett Jr., 1844), 309; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016).

¹⁵ Episcopal. Mrs. Hope Cox Lefferts, comp., "Records of Trinity Church and Parish, New York City" (New York: Typescript prepared for the New York Genealogical and Biographical Society (NYGBS), 1933-1935), vol. 1. Ms. NY-50, New York Genealogical and Biographical Society (NYGBS). Royden W. Vosburgh, comp., "Records of Christ Protestant Episcopal Church in New York City," (New York: Copied for the NYGBS, 1919), vol. 1, [formerly NYGBS NY-25A], now at Millstein Division, NYPL. Presbyterian. "First Presbyterian Church in New York City Records," NYPL Milstein Div., NYGB AZ+ Loc 09-527 [formerly NYGBS NY-24], baptisms, 1788-1803. Dutch Reformed Collegiate Churches. Tobias Alexander Wright, ed., "Baptisms from 1731 to 1800 in the Reformed Dutch Church, New York," *Collections of the New York Genealogical and Biographical Society* 3 (1902). Methodist. John Street Church (joint registers), 1785-1837, "Methodist Episcopal Church, New York, N.Y., records, 1785-1893, 1894," NYPL Milstein Div., vol. 13 [formerly NYGBS NY-21]. Lutheran. United Churches Baptisms, 1784-1807, Lutheran Church Records of New York City, NYPL Milstein Div. [formerly NYGBS NY-3]. Huguenot. Alfred V. Wittmeyer, ed., *Registers of the Births, Marriages, and Deaths, of the "Eglise Françoise à la Nouvelle York," from 1688 to 1804 (Collections of the Huguenot Society of America, volume 1)* (New York: for the Society, 1886). Friends (Quaker). William Wade Hinshaw, ed., *Encyclopedia of American Quaker Genealogy, Volume III* (1940; reprinted Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing Co., 1991).

¹⁶ The author read all of the Sinclair wills, to 185 , listed in *FamilySearch.org* (<https://familysearch.org/search/collection/1920234> : accessed 27 November 2016) > New York Probate Records, 1629-1971 > New York > Wills Index 1662-1910 vol R-S., image 252, index to Sinclair and Sinkler wills. Also, all Sinclair administrations to 1850 listed in *FamilySearch.org* (<https://familysearch.org/search/collection/1920234> : accessed 27 November 2016) > New York Probate Records, 1629-1971 > New York > Letters of administration index 1743-1910 S, images 158-159, index to Sinclair administrations.

¹⁷ The author read all of the deeds with any Sinclair named as grantee or grantor, to 1850. *Index of Conveyances Recorded in the Office of Register of the City and County of New York, Grantees S. Part First* (New York: Charles W. Baker, 1862), 245-247. *Index of Conveyances Recorded in the Office of Register of the City and County of New York, Grantors S. Part First* (New York: McSpedon & Baker, 1858), 270-271.

¹⁸ Rev. John Williams, Marriage Records, 1792-1844, p. 16, no. 51, Sinclair-Pulias marriage, 15 May 1813.

¹⁹ Return of Deaths, Hoboken, Hudson County, Volume AW, p. 414, line 10, Andrew Sinclair.

Lawrence Sinclair

Andrew Sinclair's life intersected with a man or men named Lawrence Sinclair in three areas—they shared residences twice, they were involved in political affairs together, and they both were, or became, Methodists.

Andrew Sinclair's and Lawrence Sinclair's lives intersected several times:

- In 1823, Andrew Sinclair, engineer, and Lawrence Sinclair, bellows manufacturer, lived at the same address in Greenwich Village on Perry Street near Factory.²⁰
- In 1825, Lawrence Sinclair was one of the appraisers of the estate of Andrew Sinclair's grandmother-in-law, Clarissa Pulis.²¹
- Like Andrew, Lawrence Sinclair was a Methodist. Lawrence Sinclair married Sarah Smith in 1823 in the Methodist Church,²² and had two children baptized there in 1827 and 1830.²³ Lawrence Sinclair's stillborn son was buried in the Greenwich Methodist burial ground in 1826.²⁴
- Not only were both Andrew and Lawrence Methodists, Lawrence Sinclair and wife Sarah, as well as Clarissa Sinclair, wife of Andrew, were members of Bedford Street Methodist Church between about 1837 and 1843. Clarissa was dismissed from Bedford Street to Sullivan Street in 1843.²⁵
- In 1834, Lawrence Sinclair and Andrew Sinclair were members of a Vigilance Committee of "Independent Electors" of the 9th ward, Greenwich Village, named to safeguard the coming election. In two long lists of names, Andrew Sinclair and Lawrence Sinclair were listed sequentially.²⁶

²⁰ Longworth's *American Almanac, New-York Register and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1823), 401; digital image, Fold3.com (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 17 June 2016).

²¹ FamilySearch (<https://familysearch.org/search/collection/1920234> : accessed 21 November 2016) > New York Probate Records, 1629-1971 > New York > Inventories 1783-1834 > image 2697, Clarissa Pulis inventory, 24 February 1825, modern card index citing Box P, number 169.

²² William Scott Fisher, comp., *New York City Methodist Marriages, 1785-1893* (Camden, Maine: Picton Press, 1994), 2:585.

²³ Samuel Seaman, trans., Records of the Methodist Episcopal Church, New York, N.Y., 1785-1893, NYPL Milstein Div., NYGB AZ+Loc 09-526, vol. 13 (formerly NYGBS NY-21), p. 280 (J. John, 1827), p. 284 (Thomas G., 1829). Prior to 1838, Methodist marriages and baptisms were kept jointly, not by individual church. Harry Macy Jr., "Methodist Records of New York City (Manhattan)," revised 2011, *New York Genealogical and Biographical Society* (<http://newyorkfamilyhistory.org/research-discover/research-tools/methodist-records-new-york-city-manhattan> : accessed 26 October 2016).

²⁴ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 5, Lawrence Sinclair's son, 27 January 1826; FHL 447,545.

²⁵ Membership Book, 1837-1858, Bedford Street Methodist Church, unpaginated, alphabetical by first letter of last name. C. Wesley Christman Archives of the New York Annual Conference, United Methodist Church, White Plains, New York. The author is indebted to NYAC archivist Beth Patkus for retrieving and reviewing the Bedford Street record book.

²⁶ "Ninth Ward, Democratic," *New York Evening Post*, 11 January 1834, p. 2, col. 7. "Ninth Ward," *New York Evening Post*, 1 March 1834, p. 2, col. 6. The March report names "L. Sinclair" and Andrew Sinclair. "

- In 1847, Andrew Sinclair, carpenter, had his shop at 150 Barrow Street, and residence at 181 W. 17th St. Lawrence Sinclair, carpenter, also had his shop at 150 Barrow Street, and house at 17 Morton Street.²⁷

Nearly all of the above records related to one man named Lawrence Sinclair. He was born about 1800–1801 in New York City,²⁸ and died in 1871 in Oswego County, New York,²⁹ where he moved about 1848.³⁰ After his initial appearance in city directories as a bellows manufacturer in 1823, he became a trunk maker, bookbinder, and carpenter.³¹ After moving to Oswego, he was consistently referred to as a bookbinder.³² The bellows manufacturing, trunk making, and book binding trades shared the working of leather. Lawrence Sinclair lived with Andrew for a year when he had just turned 21, but was not yet married. Then he lived with him again just as he was about to move to Oswego. About six years younger than Andrew, Lawrence is a possible brother to Andrew Sinclair.

Many records identify a second Lawrence Sinclair, a generation older than Andrew and Lawrence. This Lawrence Sinclair was born about 1764 in New York City,³³ and died in 1832, a

²⁷ *Doggett's New York City Street Directory for 1847* (New York: John Doggett Jr., 1847), 373; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 1 November 2016).

²⁸ 1855 New York State census, Oswego County, New York, City of Oswego, 3rd Ward, unpagged, dwelling 558, family 642, Lawrence St Clair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 5 June 2016), citing New York State Archives (NYSA), Albany, microfilm. His age is listed as 54, birthplace as New York County, and occupation as book binder.

²⁹ “Lawrence Sinclair,” Rural Cemetery, Oswego, Oswego County, New York, Lawrence Sinclair, died 29 March 1871, aged 71 years, memorial 161570256; *Find A Grave* (<http://www.findagrave.com>, accessed 5 June 2016). There is no image of the stone provided for this entry.

³⁰ He and wife Sarah were noted as “removed by certificate,” 28 April 1848, from the Bedford Street Methodist Church. Bedford Street Membership Record Book, 1837-1858. They were enumerated in 1850 in Oswego: 1850 U. S. census, Oswego County, New York, population schedule, Oswego 3rd Ward, p. 414 [crayon], 208 left [stamped], dwelling 407, household 455, Lawrence Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 6 June 2016), citing NARA microfilm M432, roll 576.

³¹ Bellows manufacturer: *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1823), 401, and similar titles for 1824 (p. 391), 1825 (p. 384). Trunkmaker: *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1826), 433, and similar title for 1827 (p. 442). Bookbinder (1831-1836) or Binder (1837-1842): *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1831), 580, and similar titles for 1832 (p. 606), 1833 (p. 546), 1834 (p. 620), 1835 (p. 596), 1836 (p. 605), 1837 (p. 561), 1838 (p. 574), 1839 (p. 595), 1840 (p. 573), 1841 (p. 642), 1842 (p. 559). Bookbinder: *Doggett's New-York City Directory for 1843 and 1844* (New York: John Doggett Jr., 1844), 309, and similar titles for 1844 (p. 317), 1845 (p. 378). Carpenter: *Doggett's New York City Street Directory for 1846* (New York: John Doggett Jr., 1846), 357, and similar title for 1847 (p. 373). All accessed via *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : 27 November 2016).

³² 1850 U. S. census, Oswego County, New York, pop. sch., 3rd Ward, p. 414 [crayon], 208 left [stamped], dwelling 407, household 455, Lawrence Sinclair. 1855 New York State census, Oswego County, New York, City of Oswego, 3rd Ward, unpagged, dwelling 558, family 642, Lawrence St Clair. 1865 New York State census, Oswego County, New York, City of Oswego, 3rd ward, northern district, p. 77, dwelling 396, family 459, Lawrence Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>: accessed 15 November 2016), citing NYSA microfilm. 1870 U. S. census, Oswego County, New York, population schedule, City of Oswego, Ward 3, p. 15 (stamped 144), dwelling 124, family 127, Lawrence Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>: accessed 15 November 2016), citing NYSA microfilm.

³³ In 1816 he was 53. Lawrence Sinclair household, 1816 Jury Census, New York City, Ward 10, 58 Pump Street; microfilm MN #10772, roll #1, NYCMA. In 1819, he was 56. S. Lawrence household, 1819 Jury Census, New York

bachelor.³⁴ The 1810 tax list counts him the owner of a house on Pump Street, with two other adult men living there with him, Andrew Sinclair and James Sinclair.³⁵ “Our” Andrew Sinclair would not have been taxable as an adult in 1810, so this Andrew Sinclair is of an earlier generation. The Lawrence Sinclair who appraised Clarissa Pulis’s estate in 1825 could be this Lawrence Sinclair (c. 1764–1832), rather than the younger Lawrence. The records of Lawrence Sinclair who lived with Andrew and married in 1823, as well as any record after the older Lawrence’s death in 1832, certainly represent the man who was Andrew’s contemporary.

Lawrence Sinclair (c1800–1871) was the right age and class to have been a brother of Andrew Sinclair. Bachelor Lawrence Sinclair (c1763–1832), a generation older, could be uncle to Andrew Sinclair.

George Sinclair

Andrew’s life intersected with a man, or men, named George Sinclair several times:

- Andrew Sinclair and George Sinclair married sisters. Clara (Pulis) Hamilton Sinclair’s sister Sarah “Pullis,” daughter of Jacob “Pullis,” married George Sinclair, **“son of James Sinclair,”** [emphasis added] in the North West Dutch Reformed church on 22 February 1811.³⁶ Clara Pulis’s first marriage to James Hamilton took place in the same church. This marriage is important in constructing the hypothesis identifying Andrew Sinclair’s family. Andrew Sinclair and George Sinclair were, at least, brothers-in-law—two men married to sisters. It is logical to hypothesize that they were also brothers who married sisters.
- Andrew Sinclair and George Sinclair both served in the New York City Militia in 1814 in the same brigade. They were, however, assigned to different regiments in the same brigade.³⁷
- While George Sinclair’s first children were baptized in the Dutch Reformed Church,³⁸ two daughters were baptized in the Methodist Church in 1819 and 1822.³⁹ A stillborn daughter was buried in the Greenwich Methodist Church yard in 1824.⁴⁰

City, Ward 10, 58 Pump Street; microfilm MN #10773, roll #2, NYCMA. His death record makes him about 10 years younger, aged 59 years in 1832. New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 8, Lawrence Sinclair, 17 April 1832; FHL 447,547.

³⁴ Dutch Reformed Church burial records list him as a bachelor, buried 19 April 1832. Letter to the author from Rita Hollenga, 3 October 1994, Office of the Corporate Secretary/Treasurer, Collegiate Reformed Protestant Dutch Church, New York City.

³⁵ Lawrence Sinclair, tax assessment, 1810, New York City Records of Assessment, 10th ward, Pump Street, roll 53; Finance Department, NYCMA.

³⁶ Vosburgh, ed., Records ... Madison Avenue Reformed Church, 2:6, George Sinclair–Sarah Pullis marriage.

³⁷ For Andrew, see note 11. For George, see Payroll and receipts, Capt. George Englehart’s Company, 2 October–3 December 1814 (folder 1), New York State Consolidated Militia, 10th Brigade, 1st Regiment.

³⁸ Vosburgh, ed., Records ... Madison Avenue Reformed Church, 1:18 (Catharine Ann), 1:23 (James), 1:31 (Andrew).

- George Sinclair named a son named Andrew, born in 1815, and baptized in the Madison Avenue Dutch Reformed Church.⁴¹ Andrew named a son George, born about 1820, buried in a Methodist church cemetery.⁴²
- George Sinclair's second wife, Nancy (Smith) Sinclair, was buried in 1856 in the plot in Green-Wood Cemetery owned by Andrew Sinclair's son-in-law.⁴³ Andrew and Clara/Clarissa were buried in the same lot.
- Like Andrew, George moved to Greenwich Village about 1822.⁴⁴
- Andrew Sinclair, carpenter, and George Sinclair, bookbinder, both lived at 4 Carmine Street in 1843-1844.⁴⁵

George Sinclair was born about 1791 in New York City.⁴⁶ George Sinclair was of the right age and class to have been the older brother of Andrew Sinclair. The reference in his 1811 marriage record that described him as "son of James Sinclair" is a key to the identification of Andrew Sinclair's father.

³⁹ Samuel Seaman, trans., Records of the Methodist Episcopal Church, New York, N.Y., 1785-1893, NYPL Milstein Div., NYGB AZ+Loc 09-526, vol. 13 (formerly NYGBS NY-21), p. 99 (Ann Amelia, 1819), p. 274 (Elizabeth, 1822).

⁴⁰ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 5, Geo. Sinclair's girl, 12 July 1824; FHL 447,545. The stillborn child's residence was given as Jones Street. Compare *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register and City Directory* (New York: David Longworth, 1824), p. 401; *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com/image/238/78370418>; accessed 19 November 2016), George Sinclair, bookbinder, Jones near Herring.

⁴¹ Vosburgh, ed., Records ... Madison Avenue Reformed Church, 1:31, Andrew Sinclair, son of George Sinclair and Sally Pullis, born 1 March 1815, bapt. 14 April 1815.

⁴² See note 14.

⁴³ Letter and Enclosures from Veronica Benjou, Green-Wood Cemetery, 12 November 2013. George Sinclair married Nancy Smith 9 April 1837. William Scott Fisher, comp., *New York City Methodist Marriages, 1785-1893*, 2:584. Nancy, "wife of George Sinclair," died 18 October 1862. "Died," *New York Tribune*, 21 October 1856, page 8, col. 2. The 1855 state census enumerated her with her husband, identified as "bookbinder," aged 64: 1855 New York State census, New York, New York, ward 9, election district 2, unpaginated, dwelling 148, family 320, George Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>; accessed 25 October 2016), citing NYSA microfilm. George Sinclair, book binder, lived at 35 Barrow Street in 1855. H. Wilson, comp., *Trow's New York City Directory [for the year ending May 1, 1856]* (New York: John F. Trow, 1855), 762; *HathiTrust Digital Library* (<http://www.catalog.hathitrust.org/Record/100513654>; accessed 19 November 2016). New York County (Manhattan), Register of Deaths, Liber 25, 19 October 1856, Nancy Sinclair; FHL 0447,559. The death register gave her address as 35 Barrow Street and place of burial as Green-Wood. For the owner of the lot as Andrew Sinclair's son-in-law, see note 5.

⁴⁴ George Sinclair, bookbinder, lived on Christopher Street near Bedford in 1822. *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1822), 405; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://fold3.com>; accessed 27 November 2016).

⁴⁵ *The New-York City and Co-Partnership Directory for 1843 & 1844* (New York: John Doggett, Jr., 1843), 309; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://fold3.com>; accessed 27 November 2016).

⁴⁶ 1850 U. S. census, New York, New York, population schedule, Ward 9, District 3, p. 16 (penned), dwelling 51, family 109, Geo. Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry* (www.ancestry.com; accessed 3 November 2016), citing NARA microfilm M432, roll 544, gives his age as 55 and occupation as bookbinder. 1855 New York State Census, Second Election, Ward 9, New York, New York, unpaginated, dwelling 148, family 320, George Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>; accessed 3 November 2016), gives his age as 64, occupation as bookbinder, born in New York County.

There was a second George Sinclair, of an earlier generation, living in New York City in the first quarter of the nineteenth century. His identity is explored in the discussion of his son, James Sinclair, below.

James Sinclair, son of George Sinclair

One other Sinclair male's life directly intersected with that of Andrew Sinclair. James Sinclair, tinsmith, lived at the rear of 109 Christopher Street in 1834 and 1835, the same address that Andrew occupied in 1833, 1834, 1836 and 1837.⁴⁷ This is the only instance in which James Sinclair and Andrew Sinclair's lives seem to have directly intersected.

This James Sinclair was born in 1802 and baptized at Trinity Episcopal Church, son of George Sinclair and his wife Frances.⁴⁸ In 1835 he moved to Chicago, where he continued as a tinsmith⁴⁹ and became a successful merchant, dying in 1871.⁵⁰

George Sinclair and Frances Worthmann married in the Lutheran Church on 16 April 1800.⁵¹ Another child, Jane, was born to them in 1801 and also baptized in 1801 at Trinity.⁵² George Sinclair was a bookbinder and stationer.⁵³ George Sinclair died in 1833, aged 60,⁵⁴ and his widow Frances died in 1837.⁵⁵ Their son James Sinclair was the right age to be a brother of

⁴⁷ *Longworth's New-York City Directory* (1834), 620; (1835), 596; (1836), 605; (1837), 561. Andrew was not listed in the 1835 directory.

⁴⁸ Mrs. Hope Cox Lefferts, "Records of Trinity Church and Parish, New York City" (New York: Typescript prepared for the New York Genealogical and Biographical Society (NYGBS), 1933-1935), 1:366. Ms. NY-50, NYGBS.

⁴⁹ 1860 U. S. census, Chicago, Cook County, Illinois, population schedule, Ward 2, p. 18, dwelling 126, family 157, James Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry* (www.ancestry.com : accessed 3 November 2016), citing NARA M653, roll 164.

⁵⁰ "Death of An Old New Yorker in Chicago," *New York Herald*, September 7, 1871, page 8, col. 5; digital image, *GenealogyBank.com* (<http://genealogybank.com> : accessed 23 October 2016).

⁵¹ Holland Society Transcript, identified as Lutheran Church, F 2^c, Book 87, p. 316, George Sinclair, bookbinder, to Francis [sic] Worthmann, witnesses Laurance Sinclair and Elizabet[h] Sinclair; digital image, "U.S., Dutch Reformed Church Records in Selected States, 1639-1989," *Ancestry.com* (www.ancestry.com : accessed 26 October 2016).

⁵² Lefferts, "Records of Trinity Church," 1:386.

⁵³ He first appeared as a bookbinder in 1801. *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: D. Longworth, 1801), 276; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016). Beginning in 1803, he was bookbinder and stationer. [*Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: D. Longworth, 1803)], 262; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016). He last appeared, without occupation, in 1833, at 120 Prince Street. *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1833), 546; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016). Frances, widow of George Sinclair, appeared in the 1835 directory, also at 120 Prince Street. *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1835), 596; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016).

⁵⁴ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 8, George Sinclair, 6 December 1833, 60 years, buried Trinity. FHL 447,547.

⁵⁵ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 10, Frances Sinclair, 17 January 1837, aged 59 years, buried Trinity. FHL 447,548.

Andrew Sinclair. If he was Andrew's brother, then his father George would have been Andrew's father also.

This James Sinclair, son of George, could not, however, have been Andrew's brother:

- George Sinclair and Frances Worthmann married five years after Andrew's birth, and there is no indication of a prior marriage for George.⁵⁶
- George Sinclair's 1810 census record located him in the 5th ward, with one male under 10 [son James], one female under 10 [daughter Jane], one male 26-44 [himself] and one female 26-44 [wife Frances].⁵⁷ There is no place in this household for the 15 year old Andrew.
- On 2 August 1837, Jane Sinclair of New York, "one of the two surviving children and heirs" of George Sinclair, deceased of New York City, conveyed for a dollar a parcel of property to Valentine Sillcocks, subject to a mortgage that George had taken out on the property.⁵⁸ Valentine Sillcocks was Jane's fiancé, and they were married a few days later.⁵⁹ Andrew Sinclair could not have been one of George's two surviving children since those children were Jane and James.⁶⁰

While likely related to Andrew Sinclair, James Sinclair, son of stationer/bookbinder George Sinclair, was not Andrew's brother. The repeating of names, the similar occupational class, and shared residence for one year suggest that James and Andrew were related, however, perhaps as cousins. Perhaps James the tinsmith lived with Andrew just as he was wrapping up his affairs in New York before departing for Chicago. The successful identification of Andrew Sinclair's family will require an explanation of the relationship between Andrew and James, son of George the stationer/bookbinder.

Indirect Evidence that George (born c1791) and Lawrence (c1800-1871) were brothers

Indirect evidence proves that George and Lawrence were brothers. Our subject, Andrew Sinclair, would be a third brother.

⁵⁶ He would have been too young to be the George Sinclair who married Barbara Baus on 9 March 1785 in the German Reformed Church. Charles Farrell, trans., "Records of the German Reformed Church of New York City: Marriages 1783–1786," *The New York Genealogical and Biographical Society Record* 127 (1996): 35.

⁵⁷ 1810 U. S. census, New York, New York, 5th ward, p. 253 (crayon), George Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>; accessed 3 November 2016), citing NARA M252, roll 32. The tops and bottoms of the pages appear to have been separated and mismatched when put back together, and the page numbering is irregular at best.

⁵⁸ Jane Sinclair to Valentine Sillcocks, 2 August 1837. New York City Register, New York City Deeds, Liber 387, 328–331.

⁵⁹ "Married," New York *Commercial Advertiser*, 8 August 1837, p. 2, col. 6; digital image, *GenealogyBank* (www.genealogybank.com; accessed 3 November 2016)

⁶⁰ James and wife Lydia Ann of Chicago had earlier sold their property to Valentine Sillcocks, 4 April 1838. Sillcocks recorded the deeds sequentially. New York City Register, New York City Deeds, Liber 387, 327–328.

After the death of his second wife, Nancy (Smith) in 1856, George Sinclair moved to Rome, Oneida County, New York. In 1860, he was enumerated on the federal census⁶¹ in the household of his daughter and son-in-law, Jared Matthews⁶² (all born in New York):

Jaret Matthews, 42, farmer, \$2400 in real estate, 600 in personal estate,
Amelia [Matthews—ditto marks], 41
George Sinclair, 65 [no occupation]
Elisabeth [Sinclair—ditto marks], 15
Jared Matthew[s], 6

Though no marriage license or record has been located for Jared Matthews with George Sinclair's known daughter Ann Amelia, their graves are marked in Rome, New York, with a single stone that names *Ann Amelia*, who died 25 October 1879, aged 60, as Jared's wife.⁶³ Ann Amelia Sinclair, daughter of George and Sarah (Pulis) Sinclair, was born 13 January 1819, and was baptized 5 March 1819 in the Methodist Church in New York City.⁶⁴ Ann Amelia's older brother Andrew Sinclair, born 1815, had moved to Oneida County as early as 1840,⁶⁵ perhaps in the wake of his father's second marriage in 1837.

The 1855 New York state census for Oneida County, New York, includes the following household [*emphasis added*]:⁶⁶

Jared Matthews, 35, born Sohharie [Schoharie] Co., has lived in Oneida Co. for 21 yrs., farmer
Amelia Matthews, 34, wife, b. New York county, has lived in Oneida Co. 24 yrs.
Delia Ann Matthews, 15, child, b. Wayne county, NY, has lived in Oneida Co. 14 yrs.
Elisabeth Matthews, 9, child, b. Oneida county, has lived in Oneida Co. 9 yrs.
David Sinclair, 23, cousin, b. NY county, has lived in Oneida Co. 2 yrs., cabinetmaker
Mary Sinclair, 20, wife, b. NY county, has lived in Oneida Co. 2/12 yrs. [2 months]

⁶¹ 1860 U. S. census, Oneida county, New York, population schedule, Rome, p. 224, dwelling 1733, family 1727, Jared Matthews household; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 20 November 2016), citing NARA microfilm M653, roll 618.

⁶² He died 9 June 1887 in Rome, NY, aged 70 years, leaving a wife and two daughters. Barbara Andresen, "Rome Citizen Death Notices in 1887," *USGenWeb* (<http://www.usgenweb.org/usa/ny/county/oneida/countydeaths/rc87death3.html> : accessed 20 November 2016). For his second wife, see Barbara Andresen, "Rome Citizen Death Notices in 1888," *USGenWeb* (www.oneida.nygenweb.net : accessed 20 November 2016), following this path: Deaths > Rome Citizen Deaths > March 1888, entry for 30 March 188, Matthews. This internet page does not "hold" a unique URL.

⁶³ "Ann Amelia Matthews," Rome Cemetery, Rome, Oneida County, New York, Ann Amelia [Matthews], died 25 October 1879, memorial 93022426; *Find A Grave* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 1 November 2016), photograph by Ronald E. Schuler.

⁶⁴ Samuel Seaman, trans., *Records of the Methodist Episcopal Church, New York, N.Y., 1785-1893*, vol. 13, p. 99.

⁶⁵ 1840 U. S. census, Oneida county, New York, population schedule, Lee township, p. 230 (stamped), 456 (penned), line 13, Andrew Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 21 November 2016), citing NARA microfilm M704, roll 314.

⁶⁶ 1855 New York state census, Oneida county, New York, Rome, third election district, p. 30 [the double page spread], dwelling 222, family 237, Jared Matthews; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 21 November 2016), citing NYSA microfilm.

Who was David Sinclair, who with his wife Mary lived with Jared and [Ann] Amelia Matthews? How was he “cousin” to Jared Matthews? Or, more likely, how was he cousin to Ann Amelia (Sinclair) Matthews?

David Sinclair was the son of Lawrence Sinclair (c1800-1871), one of the three putative Sinclair brothers, which—if George and Lawrence were brothers—would make him a first cousin of Ann Amelia (Sinclair) Matthews. David Sinclair married Mary A. Williams on 24 April 1855 at Bedford Street Methodist Church in New York City,⁶⁷ consistent with Mary’s having lived in Oneida County for two months when the 1855 census was taken on 20 June 1855. David’s sojourn in Oneida was short—he arrived about 1853 and by about 1857, he and Mary had moved to Oswego, where their first child, Lawrence Sinclair was born.⁶⁸ In 1877, David reported that he had lived in Oswego since 1848, but he did not allow for the brief interruption in his Oswego time when he did the accounting.⁶⁹ He probably came with his parents Lawrence and Sarah Sinclair, who were dismissed from the Bedford Street Methodist Church in New York City in 1848,⁷⁰ and were in Oswego by 1850.⁷¹ In 1871, David Sinclair and his wife Mary of Oswego, with his siblings and their spouses, “being the only children h[e]irs at-law of Lawrence Sinclair,” conveyed property in Oswego to their widowed mother Sarah.⁷²

David Sinclair, son of Lawrence Sinclair, was first cousin of Ann Amelia (Sinclair) Matthews, daughter of George Sinclair. Lawrence and George were brothers. Since George Sinclair was son of James Sinclair, so too Lawrence Sinclair was also a son of James Sinclair.

The Hypothesis

The hypothesis that emerges from indirect evidence is that there were three Sinclair brothers—George, Andrew, and Lawrence—born in New York City between 1791 and 1801. George’s marriage record named his father as James Sinclair, with no further information. George and Lawrence are known to have been brothers. Andrew’s life intersected with both brothers George and Lawrence. Andrew is hypothesized to be a third brother, and another son of James Sinclair.

⁶⁷ Fisher, *New York City Methodist Marriages*, 2:585.

⁶⁸ 1865 New York state census, Oswego county, New York, Oswego, northern dist. of the 3rd ward, p. 65, dwelling 333, family 389, David Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 21 November 2016), citing NYSA microfilm.

⁶⁹ *History of Oswego County, New York, with Illustrations and Biographical Sketches of Some of Its Prominent Men and Pioneers* (Philadelphia: L. H. Everts & Co., 1877), p. 436; digital images, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 21 November 2016).

⁷⁰ Bedford Street Membership Record Book, 1837-1858.

⁷¹ 1850 U. S. census, Oswego County, New York, population schedule, Oswego 3rd Ward, p. 414 [crayon], 208 left [stamped], dwelling 407, household 455, Lawrence Sinclair.

⁷² *FamilySearch* (familysearch.org/search/collection/2078654 : accessed 21 November 2016) > New York Land Records, 1630-1975 > Oswego > Deeds 1871 vol 133-134 > images 940-942, George M. Sinclair et al., to Sarah R. Sinclair, 3 July 1871. Mary signed “Mary A. Sinclair.”

Does this hypothesis hold up to scrutiny? Three tests must be met:

- James Sinclair, living in New York City from about 1791 (when George was born) to 1800 (when Lawrence was born) must be identified. In addition to sons George and Lawrence, his family must allow for an additional son, Andrew, born about 1795.
- The family of this James Sinclair should provide for a brother or close relative of his generation, George Sinclair the bookbinder/stationer, father of James the tinsmith, who briefly lived with Andrew Sinclair.
- The family of this James Sinclair should provide for a brother or close relative of his generation, Lawrence Sinclair, teacher, a bachelor who died in 1832, and who possibly appraised Andrew's grandmother-in-law's estate in 1825.

Identifying James Sinclair, possible father of Andrew

A correlation of census records and city directory information identifies one James Sinclair with three sons, living in New York City in 1800, and excludes another, contemporary James Sinclair of New York City. Further research makes his identity clear as brother of George the stationer/bookbinder and the older Lawrence, and provides data on their parents and likely other siblings. Andrew Sinclair's place in this family is established through this indirect evidence.

There were only two James Sinclairs listed on the 1800 federal census of New York City:

James Sinclair, 5th ward, New York:⁷³

- 1 white male 26-44
- 1 white female 26-44
- 2 white females 10-15
- 2 white female 0-9
- 1 white male 0-9
- 7 persons total

James Sinclair, 7th ward, New York:⁷⁴

- 1 white male, 26-44
- 1 white female, 26-44
- 3 white males, 0-9
- 5 persons total

⁷³ 1800 U. S. census, New York, New York, 5th ward, page 128 [penned], page 780 [crayon], James Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>: accessed 15 November 2016), citing NARA microfilm M32, roll 23.

⁷⁴ 1800 U. S. census, New York, New York, 7th ward, page 251 [penned], page 902 [crayon], James Sinclair; digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>: accessed 15 November 2016), citing NARA microfilm M32, roll 23.

The first James Sinclair, of the 5th ward, has a male child the right age to be Andrew Sinclair, but there are no candidates to be the brothers George, born about 1791, or Lawrence, born about 1800–1801. The second James Sinclair, resident of the 7th ward, has three males under the age of 10 living in his household. He is a perfect fit to be the father of the brothers George, and Lawrence, and our hypothesized brother Andrew.

Who were these two James Sinclairs, and how can they be identified? The 5th Ward in 1801 was on the East River, bounded by Catharine Street on the north and Chatham Street on the west. The 7th ward lay just north of Catharine Street, extending from the East River about half way across the peninsula.⁷⁵

The 1800 census in New York City was taken in 1801⁷⁶ so that the 1801 city directory was reviewed.⁷⁷ There were two James Sinclairs in the 1801 directory:

James Sinclair, ship captain, lived at 28 Catherine Street.

James Sinclair, carpenter, lived on Henry Street

In order to ascertain which James Sinclair was the resident of the 5th ward and which was the resident of the 7th ward in the 1800 census, the neighbors of the two James Sinclairs in the census were examined and correlated with their entries in the city directory,⁷⁸ as follows:

James Sinclair of the 5th ward, neighbors in the 1800 (1801) census:

Hugh McKutchen, not listed in city directory

John Martin, [4 listed, none on Catharine or Henry Street]

Catherine Wright, not listed

Edward Wade, soap and candle-maker, 45 Catharine

Charles Wade, soap and candle-maker, 26 Catharine

James Sinclair

Gideon Kimberly, merchant, 42 Gold

Elisha Leavenworth, merchant, 32 Catharine; store Bowne's-wharf

Samuel Russell, merchant, 34 Catharine; store, Bowne's-wharf

Epenetus [?] Smith, tailor, Chatham-square

⁷⁵ Henry Macy Jr., "Appendix," in Goodwin, *New York City Archives*, 245. See also the c1798 map, "Plan of the City of New York" (New York: engraved for D. Longworth, n.d.); The Miriam and Ira D. Wallach Division of Art, Prints and Photographs: Print Collection; NYPL; *NYPL Digital Collections* (<http://digitalcollections.nypl.org/items/5e66b3e8-e8ff-d471-e040-e00a180654d7> : accessed November 19, 2016).

⁷⁶ The census was certified 3 May 1801 and filed 2 November 1801. 1800 U. S. census, New York, New York, first two pages of Ward 1 return; digital images, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com>: accessed 1 November 2016), citing NARA microfilm M32, roll 23.

⁷⁷ *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: D. Longworth, 1801), 276.

⁷⁸ *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: D. Longworth, 1801). Entries are alphabetical and have not been specifically cited.

James Sinclair of the 7th ward, neighbors in the 1800 (1801) census:

Robert Hunt, laborer, Harman

James M. Carty, shipwright, Second

Samuel Jones, [several listed, one is] shipwright, Harman

Henry Butterworth [not listed, but there is] James Butterworth, oil silk manufactory, Harman

Isaac Loofhourase [?], not listed

Stephen Howard, not listed

James Sinclair

George Gordon, cartman, head of Harman

William Kuley [Keeley], not listed

Egburt Gilbert, not listed [Edward Gilbert, starchmaker, Henry, corner Clinton]

Hugh Jones, not listed

Joseph Sealy, shipwright, Bedlow

Based on this correlation, James Sinclair of the 5th ward in 1800 (1801) was James Sinclair, ship captain. The 5th ward neighbors to James Sinclair lived on Catharine Street, as did he. His residence at 28 Catharine falls between residents at 26 Catharine and 32 Catharine. The residents of Catharine Street included merchants and a soap and candle-making family, probably fairly stable businesses and residents in terms of location.

James Sinclair, carpenter of Henry Street, does not match up perfectly with James Sinclair of the 7th ward, since his neighbors on the census did not live on Henry Street, where he was listed in the city directory. However, Harman and Henry were both located in the 7th ward, only one block apart. Bedlow and Clinton Streets were also in the 7th ward.⁷⁹ One neighbor on the census, Egburt Gilbert, may be the same person as Edward Gilbert, who lived on Henry Street. More importantly, James Sinclair's neighbors in the 7th ward were artisans and working class people, closer in occupational status to James the carpenter than to James the ship captain. Further investigation eliminates James Sinclair, ship captain of Catharine Street, as a potential father for Andrew Sinclair.

James Sinclair of 28 Catharine Street, ship captain

James Sinclair, ship captain or shipmaster, lived for many years at 28 Catharine Street.⁸⁰ He was born about 1754 in Scotland, and died in 1819 in New York City and was buried at Brick

⁷⁹ Plan of the City of New York, c1798 (note 75).

⁸⁰From 1792 to 1798, he lived on Batavia Lane: William Duncan, *The New-York Directory, and Register, for the Year 1792* (New York: Printed for the editor, 1792), 123, and similar titles for 1793 (p. 139), 1794 (p. 170), 1795 (p. 195). John Low, *The New-York Directory and Register, for the Year 1796* (New York: John Buel and John Bull, 1796), 290. *Longworth's American Almanack, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: T. & J. Swords, 1797), 293, and similar title, 1798 (unpaginated). From 1799 to 1811, he lived at 28 Catharine St.: *Longworth's American Almanack, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: John C. Totten, 1799), 346, and similar titles for 1800 (p. 329), 1801 (p. 276), 1802 (p. 316), 1803 (p. 262), 1804 (p. 252), 1805 (p. 356), 1806 (p. 383), 1807 (p. 419), 1808 (p. 286), 1809 (p. 329), 1810 (p. 334). After a short gap in appearances, he was recorded between 1816 and 1819 at 28 Catharine: *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register and City Directory* (New York: David Longworth, 1816), 388, and similar titles for 1817 (p. 384), 1818 (p. 297 [called city-measurer]), and 1819 (p. 358 [city-measurer]). The widow of James lived at 28 Catharine in 1820: *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1820, 399. Directories accessed 27 November 2016 through *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com>)

Presbyterian cemetery.⁸¹ He married Elizabeth Morrell, and had three sons, James R., William,⁸² and Henry Sinclair, and several daughters.⁸³ Elizabeth died in 1821, aged 55, a native of New York, and was buried at Rutgers St. Presbyterian.⁸⁴ The 1800 census entry for James the ship captain accounts for his family as described in baptismal records and his widow's will, with several daughters born by 1800 but only one son. James the ship captain was of a different social class than Andrew the carpenter, Lawrence the bookbinder, or George the bookbinder. None of the names of James the ship captain's identified sons are the same as either of the proposed brothers of Andrew. Neither of the brothers George and Lawrence Sinclair was a son of James the ship captain. James the ship captain was not Andrew Sinclair's father.

James Sinclair, carpenter

James Sinclair, carpenter, living in the 7th ward, was listed in the 1800 (1801) census with three males under age 10—perfect to be the proposed brothers George, Andrew and Lawrence—and no females under 10. City directories document carpenter James Sinclair's fairly transient residences between 1793 and 1812:⁸⁵

1793	house carpenter	10 Roosevelt St.
1795	house carpenter	George St. shipyards
1796	house carpenter	corner Charlotte & Bedlow
1799	carpenter	Pump Street
1801	carpenter	Henry Street
1802	carpenter	Henry Street
1804	ship master ⁸⁶	Essex Street
1805	ship carpenter	Essex Street
1808	joiner	151 Harman

⁸¹New York City death registers, Liber 3, James Sinclair, 12 June 1819, FHL 447,544.

⁸² William Alex^r Peacock, son of Capt. James Sinclair, was b. 23 Jan. 1802 and baptized 14 Feb 1802 at Christ Episcopal. Vosburgh, "Records of Christ Protestant Episcopal Church," 1:49.

⁸³ William M. Macbean, *Biographical Register of Saint Andrews Society of New York* (New York: the Society, 1922-1925), 1:372, names one son, James. One daughter, Jane, born about 1798, married William Beebe. Laura A. Murphy De Grazia, "The Family of Adin and Lucy (Crocker) Beebe of New London and Hartford, Connecticut," *New England Historical and Genealogical Register* 152 (1998): 422-423. Jane was probably one of the two females under 10 in James Sinclair's 1800 (1801) census entry. The will of Elizabeth Sinclair names three daughters (including Jane Beebe), and two sons, William and Henry, and mentions that other children have already been provided for. *FamilySearch* (<https://familysearch.org/search/collection/1920234/> : accessed 21 November 2016) > New York > Wills 1819-1821 vol 56 > image 190, Elizabeth Sinclair, will, 4 February 1821.

⁸⁴ New York City death registers, Liber 4, Elizabeth Sinclair, 11 February 1821, FHL 447,545.

⁸⁵ William Duncan, *The New-York Directory, and Register, for the Year 1793* (New York: Printed for the editor, 1793), 139, and similar title for 1795 (p. 195). John Low, *The New-York Directory and Register, for the Year 1796* (New York: John Buel and John Bull, 1796), 290. *Longworth's American Almanack, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: John C. Totten, 1799), 346, and similar titles for 1801 (p. 276), 1802 (p. 316), 1804 (p. 252), 1805 (p. 356), 1808 (p. 286), 1809 (p. 329), 1812 (p. 283). Directories accessed 27 November 2016 through *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com>).

⁸⁶ A printer's error, this occupation duplicates that for James Sinclair, shipmaster, of 28 Catharine St., directly above. The entry for 1805 is perhaps only a partial correction, with "ship" being retained incorrectly along with the correct "carpenter" noun.

1809	joiner	151 Harman
1812	carpenter	83 Mulberry

Though the references to a ship carpenter in 1804 and 1805 are not a perfect match, no other James Sinclair other than the ship captain is listed in directories in those years. In 1809, James Sinclair appeared in the city tax assessment lists living at 151 Harman St., a house charged to Isaac Vessels, where he was taxed only on personal property.⁸⁷ In 1810, when he was missing from the city directory, he was probably the James Sinclair, who with another adult man, Andrew Sinclair, lived at the house of Lawrence Sinclair on Pump Street, taxed only on personal property.⁸⁸

James Sinclair died 27 November 1813, and his obituary appeared in two local newspapers, the more revealing of which reads:⁸⁹

Died, This morning, James Sinclair, House Carpenter and Joiner, aged 46 Years. His friends are respectfully invited to attend his funeral from 58 Pump-street, to-morrow at 4 in the afternoon.

It is interesting that the funeral was to be held “from 58 Pump Street,” though it is not called his residence. James Sinclair’s death was not recorded in the Manhattan register of deaths.⁹⁰

The conclusion is that James Sinclair (c1767–1813), carpenter, was the father of three sons: George (b. c1791), Andrew (c1795–1874), and Lawrence (c1800–1871) Sinclair:

- James’s 1800 (1801) census listing recorded 3 male children under the age of 10.
- George, Andrew, and Lawrence were all born in New York City between 1791 and 1800.
- Independent, indirect evidence proves that George and Lawrence were brothers.
- The marriage record for George named his father as James Sinclair.
- The other James Sinclair candidate for father was eliminated.
- As adults, Andrew associated with George and Lawrence, sharing residences, religious affiliation and church membership, and political affiliation.
- Andrew became a carpenter, like James, and Lawrence and George had similar occupations. All were of similar socio-economic standing.
- The names James, Andrew, Lawrence, and George, were used not only in Andrew’s generation, but in a prior generation, and a later generation.

⁸⁷ Isaac Vessels, tax assessment, 1809, New York City Records of Assessment, 7th ward, 151 Harman Street, Roll 31; Record of Assessments, Department of Finance, NYCMA.

⁸⁸ Lawrence Sinclair, tax assessment, 1810, New York City Records of Assessment, 10th ward, Pump Street, roll 54, NYCMA. This Andrew Sinclair was too old to have been the subject Andrew Sinclair, who was about 15 years old in 1810, and would not have been taxed.

⁸⁹ “Died,” *New York Commercial Advertiser*, 27 November 1813, p. 3, col.2; digital image, *GenealogyBank* (www.genealogybank.com; accessed 4 November 2016). Also, “Died,” *New-York Spectator*, 1 December 1813, p. 1, col. 4; digital image, *GenealogyBank* (www.genealogybank.com; accessed 4 November 2016). The *Spectator* entry appears under a larger heading dated 27 November, and it does not contain the reference to the funeral or to Pump Street.

⁹⁰ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 1, FHL 447,544.

The wife or wives of James the carpenter—mother or mothers of George, Andrew, and Lawrence—cannot be determined. John Sinclair, son of James and Martha Sinclair, was born 17 June 1804 and baptized 28 July 1804 at Trinity Episcopal Church.⁹¹ This child was baptized six weeks after Jane, daughter of George and Frances (Worthmann) Sinclair was baptized at Trinity.⁹² Since James the ship captain's wife was Elizabeth, James and Martha were very likely to have been James the carpenter and his wife. Both Andrew Sinclair and Lawrence Sinclair named sons John.⁹³ Whether Martha was the mother of George, Andrew and Lawrence is uncertain; she could have been a second wife for James. Another possible wife for James was named Mary. Mary Sinclair of Pump Street, aged 45 and born in New York, died of dysentery, 13 September 1813, and was buried at St. Stephen's Episcopal Church. She was perhaps the mother of an unnamed "St. Clair" child aged six months, a resident of Pump Street, born in New York, who died 5 August 1812, and was buried at St. Stephen's Episcopal Church.⁹⁴

If the hypothesis is to be fully confirmed, the relationship of Andrew Sinclair to James Sinclair, tinsmith, son of George the bookbinder/stationer, who shared Andrew's house in 1835, must be explained. Also, the relationship of the older Lawrence Sinclair, who was possibly the appraiser of the estate of Clara Pulis, Andrew's wife's grandmother, in 1825, should also be explained. The house at 58 Pump Street, from which James Sinclair, carpenter, was buried, helps to tie together Andrew Sinclair's more extended family and makes these connections.

The House at 58 Pump Street

58 Pump Street (re-named 236 Walker Street in 1829),⁹⁵ at or near the corner of Pump and Forsyth (formerly Second) Streets, was the home from 1796 to 1832 of Lawrence Sinclair, schoolmaster.⁹⁶ Lawrence first appeared in a New York directory in 1791, in a joint entry for

⁹¹Lefferts, "Records of Trinity Church," 1:388; NYGBS.

⁹²Lefferts, "Records of Trinity Church," 1:386; NYGBS.

⁹³ For J. John Sinclair, son of Lawrence and Sarah, see note 23. Indirect evidence proves John Sinclair, son of Andrew. He was enumerated in 1840 immediately after Andrew. U.S. census, New York, New York, population schedule, Ward 15, page 38 (penned, left); digital image, *Ancestry.com* (<http://www.ancestry.com> : accessed 21 June 2016), citing NARA microfilm M704, roll 308. Andrew and Clara lived with John in 1860 and John named a daughter Clara. 1860 U. S. census, New York, New York, pop. sch., 20th ward, 1st Dist., p.318, dwel.746, fam. 2431, John W. Sinclair household.

⁹⁴ New York City Death Register, Liber 1, FHL 447,544. Extant St. Stephen's records do not include the St. Clair infant's baptism, other Sinclair baptisms, or Sinclair communicants prior to 1835. Email to the author from Kristin Hardwick, executive assistant to the rector, Christ and St. Stephens, [email address withheld], 12 February 2016. Burial records from the period are missing. See Aaron Goodwin, "Church Records Held at the Archives of Christ & St. Stephen's Episcopal Church, New York City," *New York Genealogical & Biographical Society* (<http://newyorkfamilyhistory.org/research-discover/research-tools/church-records-held-archives-christ-st-stephens-episcopal-church> : accessed 1 February 2016).

⁹⁵ Gilbert Tauber, "P Streets of New York," *NYC Streets* (<http://oldstreets.com/index.asp?letter=P>: accessed 17 November 2016). Also, Lawrence Sinclair, tax assessments, 10th ward, 58 Pump Street [at Forsyth], 1828; 236 Walker Street [at Forsyth], 1829, roll 54; Record of Assessments, New York City [labeled "Manhattan"], roll 54; Department of Finance, NYCMA.

⁹⁶ John Low, *The New-York Directory and Register, for the Year 1796* (New York: John Buel and John Bull, 1796), 290. *Longworth's American Almanack, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: T. & J. Swords, 1797), 293, and similar title, 1798 (unpaginated). *Longworth's American Almanack, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: John C. Totten, 1799), 346, and similar titles for 1801 (p. 276), 1802 (p. 316), 1803 (p. 262), 1804 (p. 252), 1805 (p. 356), 1806 (p. 383), 1808 (p. 286), 1809 (p. 329), 1810 (p. 334), 1811 (p. 265), 1812 (p. 283), 1813 (p. 286), 1814 (p. 369),

James and Laurence Sinclair, schoolmasters, living at 66 Nassau Street.⁹⁷ James and Lawrence Sinclair last appeared jointly as schoolmasters in the 1793 directory,⁹⁸ replaced by Lawrence alone in 1794.⁹⁹

James Sinclair, schoolmaster, died in 1794, and his widow Gertrude Sinclair, was administrator of his estate.¹⁰⁰ James Sinclair and Gertrude Myers were married by license in the Dutch Reformed Church in New York City on 24 January 1763.¹⁰¹ As Gertrude Meyers, widow of James Sinclair, she and Elizabeth Sinclair joined the Market Street Dutch Reformed Church in 1823. Her admission under her maiden name followed the old Dutch practice.¹⁰² Elizabeth's admission as Elizabeth Sinclair suggests that she was unmarried in 1823, and born Sinclair.

The Market Street register of church members indicates Gertrude's death in 1831, and Elizabeth's in 1832. The New York City register of deaths confirms the deaths of Gertrude Sinclair in 1831¹⁰³ and Elizabeth Sinclair in 1832.¹⁰⁴ Gertrude, aged 89, was a native of New

1815 (p. 379), 1816 (p. 388), 1817 (p. 384), 1818 (p. 297), 1819 (p. 358), 1820 (p. 399), 1821 (p. 395 [widow of Lawrence, 58 Pump St., repeating the widow reference from the line above]), 1822 (p. 405), 1826 (p. 433), 1827 (p. 442). All cited directories accessed 27 November 2016 through *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com>). Also, Registers of Assessments, New York City, 10th ward, 1808–1832, NYCMA. For 1823, 1825 and 1826, Lawrence Sinclair also held the house and lot at 30 Forsyth St., also at the corner of Pump and Forsyth. For 1827–1832, George Sinclair was taxed on 30 Forsyth. The origin and nature of the Sinclairs' tenure of the properties at the corner of Pump and Forsyth is uncertain; no deed taking ownership has been found, nor of disposition after Lawrence's death. Lawrence was ordered, as owner, to correct a nuisance privy in 1818. *Minutes of the Common Council of the City of New York, 1784–1831* (New York: the City, 1917), 10:105.

⁹⁷ William Duncan, *The New-York Directory, and Register, for the year 1791* (New York: T. and J. Swords, 1791); Microfiche, *Early American Imprints, 1639-1800, First series*, no. 23337 (New York: Readex Microprint Corp., 1981-1982).

⁹⁸ William Duncan, *The New-York Directory, and Register, for the year 1793* (New York: T. and J. Swords, 1793), 139; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016).

⁹⁹ William Duncan, *The New-York Directory, and Register, for the year 1794* (New York: T. and J. Swords, 1794), 170; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016).

¹⁰⁰ *FamilySearch* (<https://familysearch.org/search/collection/1920234> : accessed 21 November 2016) New York Probate Records, 1629-1971 > New York > Letters of administration 1787 vol 3 > frame 290, letters of administration to Gertrude Sinclair, widow of James Sinclair schoolmaster, 1 November 1794. Also, "Notice," *New York Diary*, 27 November 1794, p. 2, col. 2; digital image, *GenealogyBank* (www.genealogybank.com : accessed 30 December 2012).

¹⁰¹ *Ancestry*, "U.S., Dutch Reformed Church Records in Selected States, 1639-1989" (<http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6961> : accessed 21 November 2016) > New York > Manhattan > Collegiate Church, Ecclesiastical Records, Baptisms, Members, Marriages, 1639-1774 > frame 1357, Sinclair- Myers marriage.

¹⁰² Gwen F. Epperson, *New Netherland Roots* (Baltimore: Genealogical Publishing Co., 1994), 59. An examination of the admission of other women as recorded in the church book confirms that the normal practice was to identify an adult woman by her maiden name and name her husband, deceased or living.

¹⁰³ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 7, Gertrude Sinclair, 27 November 1831, FHL 447,546

¹⁰⁴ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 8, Elizabeth Sinclair, 30 July 1832, FHL 447,547.

York, so born about 1742. Geertye Meyer, daughter of Laurens Meyer and Anna Pryer was baptized in the New York City Dutch Reformed Church on 2 December 1741.¹⁰⁵

James Sinclair and Gertrude (Meyer) Sinclair's family provides the answer to the identification of Andrew Sinclair's other associates: James the tinsmith (son of George the bookbinder/stationer), and the older Lawrence, possible appraiser of the estate of Clara Pulis.

James and Gertrude (Myer) Sinclair, who married in 1763, probably had the following children, all likely born in New York City:

- i. Lawrence Sinclair, teacher, born about 1763, named for his maternal grandfather, Lawrence Meyer. A bachelor, his house at 58 Pump Street/236 Walker Street housed his widowed mother Gertrude, and at various times some of his siblings and their families. He died 17 April 1832, and was buried at Middle Dutch Reformed church.
- ii. James Sinclair, born about 1767, the carpenter and father of George, Andrew and Lawrence Sinclair. He died in 1813 and was buried from 58 Pump Street. His wife or wives have not been positively identified.
- iii. (probably) William Sinclair, born about 1767, died of cholera 1 August 1832.¹⁰⁶ He appeared in the 1832 city directory, a bookbinder living at 236 Walker Street.¹⁰⁷
- iv. Elizabeth Sinclair, born about 1769, unmarried, died 30 July 1832 of cholera, and was buried in potter's field, New York.¹⁰⁸
- v. George Sinclair, born about 1773, married Frances Worthmann in 1800, and died in 1831.¹⁰⁹ Lawrence Sinclair and Elizabeth Sinclair, presumably his brother and sister, were witnesses to his marriage at Trinity Church. His son James the tinsmith shared a residence with Andrew Sinclair in 1835.

¹⁰⁵ Ancestry, "U. S., Dutch Reformed Church Records in Selected States, 1639-1989" (<http://search.ancestry.com/search/db.aspx?dbid=6961> : accessed 21 November 2016) > New York > New York City > The Holland Society of New York, New York Records, Volume I, Book 33 > frame 13, handwritten transcript of baptisms in the New York City Dutch Reformed Church, labelled as A32^C.

¹⁰⁶ William Sinclair and Andrew Sinclair, aged 65 and 50 respectively, said to have been born in Scotland, both died 1 August 1832, of cholera, residences given as Rivington Hospital, and buried in Potters Field. New York City. Register of Deaths, Liber 8, FHL 447,547. They were no doubt the two unnamed cholera victims residing at 236 Walker Street, who died 1 August 1832. "Report of the Board of Health," reprinted in Charles E. Rosenberg, ed., *The Cholera Bulletin* (New York: Arno Press, 1972), 96. It is likely that their supposed Scottish birthplace originated in the hospital setting in the middle of the cholera epidemic.

¹⁰⁷ Longworth's *American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1832), 606; digital image, *Fold3.com* (<https://www.fold3.com> : accessed 27 November 2016).

¹⁰⁸ New York City Register of Deaths, Liber 8, Elizabeth Sinclair, 30 July 1832, FHL 447,547.

¹⁰⁹ See notes 50–54.

- vi. (probably) Andrew, born about 1782, died 1 August 1832 of cholera.¹¹⁰ The 1832 city directory listed him at 236 Walker Street, a folder.¹¹¹ He was probably the Andrew Sinclair living with Lawrence Sinclair in 1810 at 58 Pump Street.¹¹²

After Gertrude Sinclair's death in 1831, Lawrence Sinclair, the deaths from cholera of Elizabeth, William and Andrew Sinclair in 1832, the house at 236 Walker Street, formerly known as 58 Pump St. seemed to have been abandoned. From 1832 to 1837, city assessment rolls attribute the property to "heirs of L. Sinclair," with the final listing noting "small."¹¹³ No estate file has been found for Lawrence, and no deed has been found for the sale of the property.

A fully-proved genealogical treatment of Andrew Sinclair's grandparents and their children is beyond the scope of this case study, and is not necessary in establishing the proof of the paternity of Andrew Sinclair (c1795-1874). The second and third bullet points in the list of tests for the hypothesis for the paternity of Andrew Sinclair are met: the relationships of Lawrence Sinclair, teacher, and George Sinclair, father of James Sinclair the tinsmith, to Andrew Sinclair are explained.

Conclusion

Indirect evidence identifies Andrew Sinclair (c1795-1874), carpenter, as one of three sons of James Sinclair (c1767-1813), carpenter and joiner. Only by exploring all parts of Andrew Sinclair's life were intersections found with other Sinclairs. These associations in residence, naming patterns, religion and politics, taken together, suggested a hypothesis for Andrew's brothers, and also identified potential extended family members. Census records and other documents supported the hypothesis. Importantly, the hypothesis explains not only Andrew's immediate family but accounts for an extended family constellation. Andrew Sinclair was grandson of James Sinclair and his wife Gertrude (Myer), who married in 1763 in New York City, and raised a large family.

¹¹⁰ See note 105.

¹¹¹ *Longworth's American Almanac, New-York Register, and City Directory* (New York: Thomas Longworth, 1832), 606.

¹¹² Lawrence Sinclair, tax assessment, 1810, New York City Records of Assessment, 10th ward, Pump Street.

¹¹³ Heirs of L. Sinclair, tax assessments, 10th ward, 236 Walker Street, 1832 (unpaginated), roll 54; 1833 (p. 36), 1834 (p. 35), 1836 (p. 33), 1837 (p. 43), Record of Assessments, New York City [labeled "Manhattan"], roll 55; Department of Finance, NYCMA. The microfilm image for 1835 (p.33) is illegible.